Summary

Towards a Federal Indonesia is an attempt to reconstruct how, in the period between 1917 and 1949, the Dutch and the Indonesians came to choose a federal form of government for Indonesia. Over the course of seven chronological chapters it follows the argument for the construction of a federal state as well as the various interpretations of that concept given to it over time by the relevant Dutch and Indonesian politicians. The underlying question is whether there is any truth in the recurring stereotype, found in the historiography, that the choice for a federal style of government was part of a Dutch desire to 'divide and rule'. In the course of this historical reconstruction this dominant interpretation, which is expanded on in the Status Quaestionis in the Introduction, is shown to be increasingly multifaceted and is ultimately rejected. Rather than imperialistic, the attitude of the Dutch appears to have been one of misplaced paternalism. To the Indonesians, federalism did not mean bowing to Dutch politics of 'divide and rule' but rather it was an integral part of the purposeful striving towards full independence that carried consensus amongst Indonesian politicians from all over the archipelago. The nature of the question and the emphasis on revisiting of existing historical records means that the methodological emphasis in this thesis is on primary source material and in particular those records concerning the relevant Indonesian politicians.

The chronological argument starts in 1917. Chapter 1 shows how between 1917 and 1942 various Dutch politicians promote the idea of a federal Dutch East Indies state and how the association between federalism and imperialism came about. The motivations behind these Dutch initiatives, which mainly came to the fore around 1918, were many and varied. Mühlenfeld favoured federalism as a means to promote Javanese nationalism and appeared to be afraid of a loss of Javanese culture in the event of a unitary state. In contrast, Meijroos' primary concern was to avoid potential political and economic negligence of the inhabitants of the Outer Islands. In his view the federal system would be able to address Javanese dominance through decentralisation. Colijn, on the other hand, stated that the creation of a central Volksraad (Peoples Council) in 1918 was a mistake because it would cause an undemocratic development of government. He, therefore, argued for a federation made up of representatives from each island's governing body. Ritsema van Eck viewed a federal system as a consequence of the desire for freedom by the various Indonesian peoples. In his proposed solution there would be separate autonomous regions held together by a European central governing body.

Although none of these ideas were put forward with the explicit intention to make the continued domination of Indonesia by the Dutch easier through maintaining existing di-

visions, their introduction immediately brought about a whiff of imperialism and the suggestion of a Dutch desire for continued dominance. This was partly due to the individual reputations of the initiators. Colijn's political opponents readily identified him with the bloody oppression and economic exploitation of the Indonesian archipelago. The negative reaction to the various plans for a federal state was partly also the result of the political standpoints associated with their proposers. The fact that both Colijn and Ritsema van Eck denied the existence of an Indonesian nation state made them less than popular with Indonesian nationalists. It is important to bear in mind these negative connotations with the ideas of federalism in order to make sense of the debate after 1945.

However, despite federalism's bad reputation the concept was by no means a taboo amongst Indonesian nationalists before 1942. In this period, leading nationalists, such as Mohammad Hatta and Sam Ratulangi, declared their support for a federal form of government. Moreover, several political organisations such as Pagoejoeban Pasoendan and Sarekat Ambon, argued for federalism. But overall, the choice for or against federalism was not a primary concern for the Indonesian nationalists. Their first and foremost concern was complete independence. All other political principles were of secondary importance.

Chapter 2 discusses how between March 1942 and mid-1945, during Japanese occupation, Indonesia was divided, by the Japanese, into three entirely separate regions with the result that to the Indonesian nationalists the unification of Indonesia became a priority in the formation of the independent Indonesian state. It was thought that this could be more readily achieved in a unitary state as opposed to a federation of smaller states. This explains why a large majority voted in favour of a unitary state over a federal state at the birth of the Indonesian Republic. This became the first article of the 1945 Indonesian Constitution. Although there were supporters of a federal system at the meetings of the BPUPK and the PPKI, they submitted to the majority vote so as not to endanger national unification. The choice for a unified state came about as a result of developing circumstances and rather than principles.

Chapter 3 describes the period after 1945 when a political conflict arose between the Netherlands and the Indonesian Republic. The Dutch government continued to regard the Dutch East Indies government as its lawful representative in Indonesia and, to begin with, did not recognise the authority of the Indonesian Republic at all. In March 1946, a preliminary agreement was reached between politicians from both the Indonesian Republic and the Dutch East Indies government setting out a proposal for an independent federal Indonesia. The then recently signed treaty between France and Vietnam formed an important source of inspiration for this agreement. To the Dutch, the argument that settled the matter in favour of a federation was a desire to avoid Javanese dominance and to take into account the differences between the various people groups within the archipelago. Between November 1945 and July 1947, the cabinets of the Republic, led by Prime Minister Sjahrir, reached a federal compromise despite the fact that the principle of a unitary state had been agreed in the Constitution.

Due to upcoming parliamentary elections in the Netherlands, the Dutch government were reluctant to confirm the preliminary agreement with the Indonesian Republic at a conference at the Hoge Veluwe in April 1946 and the negotiations reached an impasse.

However, the Dutch East Indies government under Van Mook decided to proceed with the plans for a federal state. They organised a conference with Indonesian representatives from Borneo and East Indonesia in the small town of Malino near Makassar. This conference started in July 1946, immediately after the British military authorities had handed over power to the Dutch East Indies authorities. In the preceding months, the negotiations between the representatives of the Indonesian Republic and the Dutch colonial civil servants in this vast area outside Java and Sumatra had completely stalled. Two governors representing the Indonesian Republic, Ratulangi from Sulawesi and Pudja from the Lesser Sunda Islands, had even been arrested. At this conference in Malino representatives largely agreed to the federal set-up as it had been proposed by the Dutch government. The delegates, who had been selected by the colonial authorities, showed in their contributions and amendments at the conference that for the time being they were prepared to pursue their nationalistic aspirations in co-operation with the Dutch. In Republican circles, meanwhile, the conference of Malino was widely criticised. The delegates were not thought to be representative and were said to be puppets of the Dutch. After the Dutch parliamentary elections in May 1946, there was general support in the Netherlands for the federal plans of Van Mook. These plans, however, had not been part of the Schermerhorn cabinet's policy for decolonisation. Initially, Schermerhorn's successor Beel indicated support for the federal plans but emphasised the need to maintain the unity within the Kingdom of the Netherlands. This change of direction made the Republic suspicious of the way in which the plans of the Malino conference were being carried out. Back in the Netherlands, the Communist Party and part of the Labour Party shared this concern. Palar, an Indonesian Member of Parliament, strongly voiced similar views in the Dutch parliamentary debates.

Chapter 4 starts at the resumption of the political dialogue between the Indonesian Republic and the Netherlands in September 1946. A delegation from the third cabinet led by Sjahrir entered into negotiations with the Dutch Commissie-Generaal (Commission General) chaired by the former prime-minister Willem Schermerhorn. These negotiations did not take long and in November an agreement was proposed in the Javanese mountain resort of Linggadjati which, from a point of view of a federal Indonesia, bore a strong resemblance to the preliminary agreement of 6 months earlier. However, the proposed agreement of Linggadjati had a much stronger chance of success because the third cabinet led by Sjahrir had a much broader political base than the earlier Republican governments and moreover, the Dutch Beel cabinet had a majority support in parliament. Both before and after the negotiations in Linggadjati, the Commissie-Generaal discussed the proposals and the proposed agreement with a delegation of representatives from Borneo and East Indonesia. However, these discussions did not directly influence the decisions, nor were any of these representatives ever invited to immediate negotiations of the Dutch with the Republican government. Within the Dutch parliament, the form of a federal state never became a major topic in the debate around the proposed agreement of Linggadjati. There was a lot of opposition, however, to the idea of drafting a new constitution of a new Netherlands-Indonesian Union to replace the Kingdom of the Netherlands. This resulted in a motion from Romme-Van der Goes van Naters in which the Dutch parliament only agreed to the Linggadjati proposal as officially interpreted by Minister Jonkman and explained by the Commissie Generaal. The

Indonesian Republic was very critical of this course of action, with the result that the initial positive mood surrounding the agreement turned into broadly carried condemnation of the so-called 'dressed-up' Linggadjati agreement. As an additional result, the Republican government now also seemed to form reservations about the federal aspects of the agreement.

Whilst the discussions about the proposed agreement of Linggadjati were still in full swing in both the Netherlands and Indonesia, Van Mook decided to organise a second federal conference in Denpasar in December 1946. The aim of this conference was to create an East Indonesian state. At the same time, violence in South Sulawesi spiralled into unprecedented repression by the Dutch army, during which thousands of Indonesian civilians were killed without any form of judicial process. The election of a preliminary President and Chair for the preliminary East Indonesian parliament at the conference in Denpasar showed a sharp division between representatives focused on the Republic and those representatives who wanted to emphasize co-operation with the Netherlands. Balinese representative Soekawati, who belonged to the latter group, was elected as President by a small majority. The pro-Republican group was led by Buginese representative Tadjuddin Noor who was elected Chair. The federal principle was not a point of discussion at the conference. Equally, there was broad concensus amongst the Indonesian representatives around the issue of New-Guinea, which was regarded as integral part of the State of East Indonesia. Unlike at the Malino Conference of July 1946, however, there were no representatives from New-Guinea in Denpasar to defend their point of view. The Republic regarded the decisions made at the Denpasar conference as conflicting with the Linggadjati Agreement, because in the Linggadjati Agreement the Indonesian Republic would work together with the Dutch to form a United States of Indonesia. In March 1947, in the Republican KNIP in Malang, a motion by Manai Sophiaan was accepted in which he urged the addition of the territories outside of Java and Sumatra to the Indonesian Republic. Even so, this same parliament accepted the federal agreement of the Linggadjati Agreement, which was officially signed in Jakarta on 25 March by both representatives of the Dutch government and the government of the Indonesian Republic. A few months earlier the first cabinet of the State of East Indonesia had been installed in Jakarta under the leadership of trade consultant Nadjamoeddin Daeng Malewa from Makassar. This cabinet made a weak impression from the start and in many ways appeared to conform to the wishes of the Dutch East Indies government. Opposition within his own Parliament in Makassar resulted in an immediate vote of no confidence. Protests of the pro-Government faction against the role of the pro-Republican leader of Parliament Tadjuddin Noor led to his resignation. Although during this period the formation of a federation was formally pursued through the Linggadjati Agreement and Denpasar proceedings, the way in which it was pursued met with strong opposition in the Netherlands and the Indonesian Republic as well as among the politicans in the newly formed State of East Indonesia.

Chapter 5 discusses how opposing interpretations of the federal vision as set out in the Linggadjati Agreement contributed to the deteriorating of the relationship between the Netherlands and the Republic of Indonesia in May 1947. Unofficial Dutch support for the undemocratic and federally oriented Partai Rakjat Pasoendan in West Java caused the federal principle to be associated with the fear that the Dutch wanted to occupy Indonesia once

more. In West Borneo the Dutch East Indies administrators were worried that the formation of a state of Borneo had so little support that they decided to choose a 'bottom up' approach to the building of a federation. This lead to the formation in May 1947 of the Special Region of West Borneo under Sultan Hamid van Pontianak, and recognized by the Dutch East Indies government.

Between May and July 1947 the relations between the Dutch and the Indonesian Republic deteriorated dramatically. The Dutch accused the Republic of not adhering to the federal principles of Linggadjati by for instance supporting the armed protests in Borneo and East Indonesia. The Republic on the other hand maintained that the Dutch, in contradiction of the Linggadjati Agreement, were forming a federal state unilaterally. The Indonesian political leadership of East Indonesia and West Borneo repeatedly expressed their fervent desire to take an active part in the conversation regarding the shaping of the future Indonesian state. This nationalism resulted in the publication of a political memorandum by each of these regions expressing their viewpoint regarding the conflict between the Dutch and the Indonesian Republic. However, in the context of the escalating conflict, the Dutch government used these political declarations to suggest Indonesian support for a military attack on the Indonesian Republic. A last-minute attempt by East Indonesia's prime minister Nadjamoeddin to contain the political crisis in talking to Sjahrir as one Indonesian to another, failed.

In July 1947, when the Netherlands launched a large military offensive 'Operation Product' against the Indonesian Republic on Java and Sumatra, both Sultan Hamid and the cabinet led by Nadjamoeddin agreed to the Dutch actions. During the debate in the Dutch Second Chamber that led to the decision, the only Indonesian Member of Parliament, Nico Palar, resigned from both Parliament and the Dutch Labour Party PvdA. The military attack immediately made it onto the agenda of the United Nations Security Council. In response to this, the Dutch East Indies government decided to send a delegation of federal Indonesian politicians to the United States to testify to the United Nations that in addition to the Indonesian Republic there was 'another Indonesia' which was prepared to co-operate with the Netherlands in the way in which it was trying to help build a federal Indonesian state. This attempt was a complete failure. Instead Sjahrir was given the opportunity to plea the Republic's cause to the members of the Security Council. The federal Indonesians were not given the right to speak in the meeting. Thus, the Indonesian Republic gained wide international recognition whilst the federal politicians were regarded as puppets of the Dutch. Following this visit to the United States and the United Nations, the group of federal Indonesians visited the Netherlands. Although the visit started off as a happy occasion, it ended in a surprise when Nadjamoeddin spoke harshly to the Dutch government. The failure in the USA had been caused by the Dutch because the Dutch had recognised the Indonesian Republic by coming to an agreement in Linggadjati but had neglected to come to an agreement with East Indonesia. Nadjamoeddin's willingness to openly criticise the Dutch was quite possibly a result as well of the fact that he now had little left to lose. Charged with corruption the members of the East Indonesian cabinet who had remained behind in Indonesia had decided that he would have to stand down.

Chapter 6 discusses how after the military offensive in July 1947 Indonesian politicians worked with the Dutch East Indies government to form several new states in the newly

conquered territories of Java, Sumatra and Madura. The Indonesian Republic regarded this as a breach of the Linggadjati Agreement by the Dutch, because they refused to recognise the authority of the Republic on these islands. The state of Pasoendan in West Java came into being after three conferences, which were heavily criticised by the Republic for containing unrepresentative delegates as well as the amount of influence from the Dutch civil servants involved. However, at the third conference, the pro- Republican representatives managed to gain substantial influence and they were therefore equally well represented in the preliminary parliament of the new state. At the end of the third West Java Conference the Republican Wiranatakusumah was elected Head of State and he appointed Adil Poeradiredja as prime minister.

The fact that the Republicans participated in the conferences in West Java was due to a wider development of a federalist stream within the Republic. This Republican federalism was related to the plebiscite movement. Aboard American naval vessel USS Renville, the Netherlands and the Republic of Indonesia reached an agreement, by means of mediation by the UN-formed Good Offices Committee. In the Renville principles the Republic submitted, for the time being, to Dutch military occupation of certain parts of Java, Sumatra and Madura and agreed to co-operate once more with the Dutch in the formation of a federal Indonesian state. The Republic agreed on the condition that the population would be able to express their opinion on the future political status of their country by means of a plebiscite.

Another state was established, without a conference, in East Sumatra. This state was dominated by the Malayan minority in that region and was closely allied with the previous feudal rulers. Within the East Sumatran government, there was no space for Republican influences. This lack of democratic representation in this state was a source of much criticism from the Republic. The Dutch political advisor in this region was also quick to point out these weaknesses to the Dutch administrators in Jakarta.

In December 1947 significant change came about in East Indonesia through the formation of a new cabinet led by the Balinese Anak Agung. This new government had a wider parliamentary base as several progressive, pro-Republican ministers were part of it. Initially, Anak Agung took a neutral stance but in the course of 1948 this changed. The new political course in East Indonesia could be seen in the initiative of a parliamentary goodwill-mission to the Republic. The Republic officially recognised East Indonesia on 19 January 1948 and in March, the parliamentary mission actually took place.

Whilst the above developments took place several other steps were taken in order to form a federal Indonesian government. Early in December 1947 the Komite Indonesia Serikat (United Indonesia Committee) was formed which was made up entirely of Indonesian representatives from all the main regions, with the exception of the Indonesian Republic. To the federal Indonesian nationalists, the decision whether or not to participate proved a major dilemma. Several federal representatives, like those from East Indonesia, argued from the outset that the participance of the Republic was essential. Other states, such as East Sumatra, emphasised the importance of speedy progress and were prepared to form an initial interim government without Republican participation. A Provisional Federal Government was installed on 9 March 1948 representing all the major states except for the Republic.

Although the Republic with its new federalist stream was at this time more prepared to go along with the Dutch plans, the manner in which the Provisional Federal Government was put together was completely unacceptable to the Republicans. Even though a significant number of Indonesians took part, it was still led by Lieutenant Governor General Van Mook and former members of the Dutch East Indies government dominated the leadership. The Republic therefore regarded the Provisional Federal Government as no more than a slightly reformed Dutch colonial government.

Negotiations between the Dutch and the Republic stagnated, partly due to the way in which the new states in the territory which had formerly been part of the Republic, had been created and partly due to the way in which the Dutch were setting up the Federal Indonesian government. At the end of May 1948 in Bandung a federal conference was opened with a great number of representatives from the various states, but without representation from the Republic. The semi-permanent conference which aimed to further advance the preparations for the formation of the new state, did not bring tangible results in the first few weeks. During the recess of July 1948, Anak Agung and Adil Poeradiredja initiated the Bijeenkomst voor Federaal Overleg (BFO, Federal Consultative Assembly), in which government leaders of the various non-Republican states came together. After a week the BFO proposed a resolution which pressed the case for the rapid installation of a truly Indonesian interim government. The reason for haste was the rapid approach of 1 January 1949, the date set in Linggadjati for the transfer of sovereignty. Anak Agung pronounced that the time had come for Indonesians to be their own rulers. Van Mook and his advisors were reserved in their reception of the BFO initiative.

July 1948 saw parliamentary elections in the Netherlands due to the need to change the Constitution in order to transfer sovereignty to Indonesia. The formation of the new cabinet brought about a dramatic change with regards to influential ministerial posts relating to the Indonesian situation. The new Minister for Overseas Territories came from the KVP and Beel took Van Mook's place as High Representative of the Crown. Van Mook suspected that federal Indonesian politicians had been instrumental in securing his dismissal. Initially, both Beel and the Dutch Drees cabinet seemed prepared to seriously involve the BFO in decisions around the structure of the Indonesian state. However, in reality BFO's influence was still minimal. A major dispute developed due to the Dutch refusal to let the federal Indonesians play a part in its bilateral discussions with the Republic. Moreover, Beel underestimated the strength of the nationalist sentiment, which was captured in Sultan Hamid's slogan: 'It's time we did this ourselves!' ('Wij willen het nu zelf doen').

At the start of December 1948 a new attempt, led by Dutch Minister of Foreign Affairs Stikker, to reach an agreement with the Republic failed. The Dutch ministers had not involved the federalists in the discussions at all. However, the relations between East Indonesia and the Republic continued to improve. On 18 December 1948 a Republican goodwill mission left Jakarta for Makassar. The airplane had to turn back immediately however, apparently due to engine troubles. In all likelihood, the real reason for its return was that the next morning the Dutch launched a second military attack on the Republic. Members of the goodwill mission were arrested in Jakarta. The entire East Indonesian cabinet as well as the Pasoendan cabinet stepped down as a protest in response to the attacks.

Chapter 7 discusses how after the Dutch offensive of December 1948 Beel as High Representative of the Crown deployed a new political strategy. Because the Dutch now occupied Yogyakarta, the government seat of the Indonesian Republic, and had imprisoned most of its political leaders, the existence of the Indonesian Republic could now be plausibly denied. Initially, the Dutch government took Beel's view. However, a few days after the start of the attack the UN Security Council came together and it emerged that the Dutch view was not widely shared internationally. On 28 January 1949 the Security Council urged in a resolution for the release of the Republican leaders and a reinstating of Republican rule in Yogyakarta.

In early 1949 the BFO changed directions. Up until then, this assembly of non-Republican states had expressed its nationalistic aspirations, but it would generally accept any political decisions by the Dutch as fait accompli. Beginning in January 1949 several journeys were undertaken by members of the BFO to visit imprisoned Republican leaders. These visits led to valuable political contacts. The BFO decided to endorse the Security Council resolution and urged for the release of the Republican leaders and the reinstatement of their leadership. At the same time, the old differences within the BFO between the more conservative states, such as East Sumatra, and progressive states, such as East Indonesia, became more pronounced. This almost led to a breech within the BFO. However, the BFO maintained its new course. Two more conferences were organised on Sumatra with delegates from the states recognised by the BFO as well as representatives from those territories which had been part of the Republic but had recently been occupied by the Dutch.

In May 1949 there was an important breakthrough in the relations between the Netherlands and the Republic. The Netherlands had given up its forceful opposition and now recognised the existence of the Republic. Roem and Van Roijen managed to come to an agreement in a short space of time. After a few preliminary talks it was decided that the Republic could regain its leadership in Yogyakarta. Once again, the federal Indonesian politicians were initially excluded from these talks. This was partly due to divisions within the BFO. As soon as a BFO delegation (minus the Sumatran representatives) was admitted to the debate, a federal success was scored. It was decided that the BFO could form one of three delegations to the upcoming Round Table Conference (RTC) in The Hague. Moreover, the federalists and the Republicans immediately agreed on another matter: according to both groups of nationalists West New Guinea would belong to the Indonesian federation when it would gain its sovereignty.

During this period, both the Republican and the federal Indonesian leaders wanted to continue with the inter-Indonesian talks which had been started during the BFO visits to Bangka by means of a large Inter-Indonesian Conference. After the Republican leaders had been released and the Republic's power had been restored in Yogyakarta, this conference started initially in the Republican capital and then moved to Jakarta. The federalists and Republicans agreed easily on most of the issues that were up for debate. However, the most important success was the binding together of the Indonesian nation that happened as a result of the talks.

This success story of reconciliation was clearly displayed at the RTC which was held between 23 August and 2 November 1949 in The Hague. The two Indonesian delegations

agreed on most matters. For a large part, this was due to the efforts of the federalist politicians. The one exception was in the matter of a future army for the Indonesian federation. This topic of discord had come up at the Inter-Indonesian Conference as well. Whilst the federalists wanted to maintain the KNIL as a substantial part of the armed forces, the Dutch and the Republicans were united in their view that the KNIL would have to be disbanded. All Indonesian citizens who had served in the KNIL would be given the right to become part of the new federal Indonesian army but the Republican army and its leaders would form its core. The main point of dispute between the Netherlands and Indonesia remained around the question of New Guinea. In particular, the BFO was determined to the very end that West New Guinea should be included in the transfer of sovereignty. However, the Dutch won the negotiations and West New Guinea would remain a Dutch Overseas Territory for at least one year, in which a final settlement had to be reached.

After the RTC the decisions made still had to be agreed by both the Netherlands and in Indonesia and a first federal cabinet had to be formed before the transfer of sovereignty from the Netherlands to the United States of Indonesia could finally take place. In the final weeks it became apparent in Indonesia that the survival sustainability of the federation was under threat. In West Java there were rumours of a coup led by the infamous Captain Westerling who previously had lead the violence on Sulawesi. Moreover, within a number of states there were proposals to relinquish the state and merge with the Republic. Nevertheless, the birth of the United States of Indonesia came about on 27 December 1949 due to the unity between the federal and Republican nationalists.

This thesis finally concludes that the Dutch preference for a federal Indonesian state was informed by their policy of decolonisation together with their conviction that a large part of the Indonesian people were not sufficiently represented in the Indonesian Republic as it was formed in August 1945. At the time of this formation there had been a consensus amongst its founders that a unitary state would give the best guarantee for complete Indonesian independence. Nevertheless, between 1946 and 1949, several Indonesian nationalists chose to be part of the construction of a federal system. During this same period, criticism of the policy that was leading to the construction of a federal state continued because of Dutch political and military repression of the Indonesian people and the refusal of the Dutch colonial rulers to involve the Republic in the formation of a federation. The federalists were also prevented from involvement in bilateral talks with the Republicans. From the very beginning, the formation of an Indonesian federation was portrayed by critics as a Dutch attempt to maintain divisions within Indonesia in order to maintain political power. Indonesian nationalists outside Java, Sumatra and Madura who co-operated with the development of a federal structure, were portrayed as puppets by these same critics. However, this research has shown that the primary aim of the majority of these federalist Indonesian nationalists, as well as of the politicians in the Republic, was complete Indonesian independence. Within this group there was a growing conviction that the Netherlands was offering too little opportunity for political initiatives and was too hesitant to relinquish control. This ambiguity did not only cause a self-conscious attitude on the part of the federal nationalists but also meant that these politicians began to take their own course of action which meant that in 1949, together with their Republican colleagues, they managed to

form an independent, federal Indonesian state. To close, the conclusion is followed by the contrasting recollections of two of the main players.

The epilogue briefly describes what happened in the eight-month period that the new federal state existed. On 17 August 1950 the Republic of the United States of Indonesia was transformed into a unitary state.